



**CITY OF SCOTTSDALE  
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES**

**THURSDAY, MARCH 17, 2011  
ROOM 7, GRANITE REEF SENIOR CENTER  
1700 N GRANITE REEF ROAD, SCOTTSDALE, AZ**

**PRESENT:** David Schmidt, Chair  
Len Marcisz, Vice-Chair  
Bob Cook, Commissioner  
Timothy P. Burns, Commissioner  
DeeJaye Lockwood, Commissioner  
Jennifer Smithey, Commissioner

**ABSENT:** Earl Eisenhower, Commissioner

**STAFF:** Don Meserve, Historic Preservation Officer/City Archaeologist  
Debbie Abele, Historic Preservation Consultant

**VISITORS:** Karen Lehman, J. Robert Wyatt, Peter & Louise Frechette, Sherlyn Baker, Jewell Horrell, Dominic Bujurlic, Roc Rogen, Margaret Bogan, Variette Satlak, Sharon Gurley, Lynne Wright, Jack Wifler, Gloria Wifler, Jim Murphy, Cindy Ott, Dorothy J. DeFir, Darin Johnson, Millie Winters, Joseph Faldut, Collene Lawrence, Rim M. Kyelbgool, Sylvester Bello, Carlos Turak, Barbara Phillips, Joan Dizzart, Tom Mehen, Laurel Hirsch, Carol Lynn Mehen, Barbara Baker, Patricia M. Jones, Sandra Jean Edwards, Susan Winbel, Janet Johnson, Jim Bennett, Tom Prombo, Jeff Carter, Jenney Carter, Marilyn Pope, Lareen Cerelli, May Medler, Matt Peterson, Janet Peterson, Bev Gasson, Beverly Petit, Candee Kjeldgaard, Audyth Bernstein, Diane Frank, M. J. Walsh, Christine Squellaro, Marilyn Porstman, John Porstman, Vernon Paige, Tobias Namenson, Myrna Walker, Ketta Kelly, Martha Frunell

**CALL TO ORDER**

Chair Schmidt called the Historic Preservation Commission special meeting to order at 5:32 p.m.

**Roll Call**

A formal roll call was conducted confirming members present as stated above.

**Public Comment**

None.

## Public Hearing Item

1. **Report/Discussion/Possible Action: Villa Monterey Units 1-7 HP Overlay Zoning, Cases 13-ZN-2010 and 4-HP-2010**

**Consider a request by City of Scottsdale/Historic Preservation Commission, applicant, to rezone Villa Monterey Units 1-7 from Townhouse Residential District (R-4) to Townhouse Residential District, Historic Property (R-4 HP) and from Multiple-Family Residential District (R-5) to Multiple-Family Residential District, Historic Property (R-5 HP) on 115± acres in the vicinity of Miller and Chaparral Roads, from Meadowbrook to Medlock and from 74<sup>th</sup> Place to 79<sup>th</sup> Place, containing 758 homes and 13 common tracts, by adding Historic Property overlay to this townhouse development and placing Villa Monterey Units 1-7 on the Scottsdale Historic Register as a historic district.**

Mr. Meserve presented information on the Villa Monterey Units 1-7 HP overlay zoning case with a PowerPoint presentation on the location, architectural styles, features, public involvement and staff recommendation in support of the historic district. The HPC has discussed townhouses and Villa Monterey in about thirty meetings over the last three years. Ms. Abele provided a detailed description of the designation report including; the ordinance criteria for designation, the high degree of integrity, the influential approaches used by the local builder for the development and marketing of townhouses, the excellent examples of architecture and customized features and details from the era, and why the Commission should vote in favor of its eligibility and integrity.

The Commission asked staff questions on the staff report concerning integrity and changes to roofing materials before the Chair asked for public comment on the case. Reroofing a house is a common and necessary change to homes in the area; new roofs did not make homes non-contributing. Fifty-seven people signed in for the public hearing and some completed cards to speak at the hearing.

Jim Murphy, President of Villa Monterey Unit 1 spoke about the unanimous support of the board and how he contacted all the homeowners in his HOA and that 91+ percent were in support. The evidence that the neighborhood is significant is there and the Commission should vote in favor.

Diane Frank, Unit 7 spoke as a licensed realtor and said, in her experience with selling homes in historic districts, the home values and taxes will increase. The sale prices may be \$50 thousand more than homes that are not in historic districts.

John Porstman, Unit 4 asked which homes were altered to the point they were determined to be non-contributing. Ms. Abele replied that a few homes had additions that used materials not found in the construction of other homes in the neighborhood or the addition of elements like large pop-ups of stucco around the windows.

Peter Frechette, Unit 1 spoke in support of the historic district and recalled how he had selected Villa Monterey as the neighborhood where he wanted to live. Considered moving to Santa Barbara, Monterey or Santa Fe and decided that the homes in Villa Monterey in Scottsdale had the style and weather they liked, and it was the best community they could find.

Marilyn Pope, Unit 5 credited Kathy Feld for their neighborhood being considered for designation and wanted to publically thank her for all her hard work over the years.

Jack Wifler, Unit 6 described how he liked the solid block construction and 12" joists in the roof in the Villa Monterey townhouse construction. He also owns a property in the Village Grove 1-6 historic district and said the neighborhood has improved since it was designated in 2005.

Chair Schmidt closed the public testimony and asked Commissioners for comments.

Commissioner Burns said it was nice to have the community come out in support; it makes the Commission's job easier. Vice-Chair Marcisz seconded Commissioner Burns' comments thanking visitors for coming in support of their neighborhood being considered for historic district designation and thanked both Mr. Meserve and Ms. Abele for recognizing what citizens want. He noted that this case is a model of how cities can work in partnership with residents and that the Commission is very familiar with Villa Monterey based upon many prior meetings.

**MOTION ON CASES 13-ZN-2010 AND 4-HP-2010 BY VICE-CHAIR MARCISZ, 2<sup>ND</sup> BY COMMISSIONER BURNS, THAT THE SCOTTSDALE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION RECOMMEND TO THE SCOTTSDALE PLANNING COMMISSION AND THE CITY COUNCIL THE REZONING OF VILLA MONTEREY UNITS 1 – 7 FROM TOWNHOUSE RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT (R-4) TO TOWNHOUSE RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT, HISTORIC PROPERTY (R-4 HP) AND FROM MULTIPLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT (R-5) TO MULTIPLE-FAMILY RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT, HISTORIC PROPERTY (R-5 HP) ON 115+ ACRES. VICE-CHAIR MARCISZ MOVED THIS RECOMMENDATION FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS:**

**THE PROPERTIES ARE HISTORICALLY AND ARCHITECTURALLY SIGNIFICANT AS A COLLECTION OF HOMES THAT ILLUSTRATE A PARTICULAR TYPE OF BUILDING AND A DEVELOPMENT PATTERN THAT INFLUENCED THE PHYSICAL FORM OF SCOTTSDALE IN THE POSTWAR ERA AND REMAINS DISCERNABLE AND DISTINCTIVE. THERE ARE THREE SUPPORTIVE REASONS FOR THIS NOMINATION;**

- 1. THE INFLUENCE ON HOW TOWNHOMES SUBSEQUENTLY DEVELOPED IN ARIZONA,**
- 2. THE CURRENT HIGH DEGREE OF INTEGRITY AS WITNESSED BY THE 99% INTEGRITY RATING GIVEN BY DEBBIE ABELE, AND**
- 3. THE INTACT ORNAMENTATION AND CUSTOMIZED BUILDING FEATURES OF THE HOMES THAT SET THEM APART AS A PRODUCT OF A HISTORIC PERIOD AND GIVE IT A UNIQUE SENSE OF TIME AND PLACE WHICH SHOULD BE PRESERVED.**

**MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY SIX (6) TO ZERO (0).**

Mr. Meserve noted that the tentative hearing date for the Planning Commission was April 27, 2011 and the tentative date for a City Council hearing was June 7, 2011.

Chair Schmidt advised visitors that the Commission had some further business and that they were welcome to leave now or stay. There was a short break while Villa Monterey residents left.

## **Regular Agenda Items**

### **2. Report/Discussion/Possible Direction: HPO Report on Upcoming Events, Activities and Projects**

Mr. Meserve reported on the ongoing planning for 60<sup>th</sup> Anniversary events for the incorporation of the city including historic tours being planned. There is a website listing the events. Mr. Meserve listed agenda items for the next meeting including the Commission selecting places of worship, a discussion of the Taliesin West HP boundary and their response to the Commission's letter, and a discussion of Browns Ranch area. He noted that a representative from the Preserve staff will attend the meeting for the Browns Ranch item. The Chair suggested placing Browns Ranch first on the agenda as a higher priority than the selection of places of worship.

Mr. Meserve also reported on the re-roofing project for Loloma School that was brought to the staff's attention by Commissioner Burns at the last meeting. Mr. Meserve signed a Certificate of No Effect based upon a review of the plans and hopes for better and earlier communication in the future on exterior projects on city-owned historic buildings. The Chair expressed his interest in avoiding problems like this in the future and that the Historic Preservation Office should be included in exterior projects.

### **3. Commissioner Comments and Announcements**

Vice-Chair Marcisz noted that they are proceeding with the production of the vignette with Channel 11 for the Pullman car in the McCormick-Stillman Railroad Park and that Commissioner Eisenhower will be interviewed in the sound studio on his Uncle's use of the car.

### **4. Future Meeting Dates and Agenda Items**

The next meeting will be on April 14, 2011 in the One Civic Center.

**Adjournment: 6:46 p.m.**

Summary Minutes Prepared by Don Meserve